

RVO upholds decision to recognise EFS after objection by TFS

On 15 April 2021, European Falabella Studbook (EFS) was recognised as a studbook association by the RVO. The Belgian government also recognised EFS during the summer of 2021. EFS was also given the mandate to issue 'real' Falabella passports. Because TFS, who took over the old Falabella studbook at the beginning of 2020, did not agree with the decision of the RVO, Sue Eckholdt lodged an objection to this decision with the RVO in the spring of 2021.

Of course the RVO informed us about this, after which we also informed our members. The grounds for their objection were also communicated to the EFS Board.

- Objection signed by Susan Eckholdt.
- TFS is the only daughter Falabella studbook for our horse breed.
- EFS is a splinter studbook.
- EFS cannot show reciprocity to the mother studbook ACCF.
- ACCF does not recognise EFS and Evaristo Falabella.
- Evaristo Falabella cannot legally export Falabellas from Argentina.
- Evaristo Falabella horses are refused registration by the TFS and the FMHA.
- TFS holds the DNA database.

RVO could not recognise EFS!

- EFS cannot demonstrate that there is not the breeding book of origin of the breed covered by its breeding programme or demonstrate that there is no other known breed society.
- EFS cannot demonstrate recognition from ACCF.
- ACCF doesn't recognise Evaristo Falabella.
- EFS nor Evaristo Falabella can export legally pure breed mini horses Falabella.
- ACCF has not recognised any other daughter studbook except TFS.
- Reina Knaap passed FSE to TFS after failing to find a registrar in Holland to take the job.
- EFS does not have access of all the records of Mini Horses Falabella, only ACCF has it.
- It seems that EFS is entering as mini horses Falabella those sold by some Evaristo Falabella.
- EFS is mixing the real mini horses Falabella with those of unknown origin.
- The Falabella mini horse is a very rare pure breed developed by Mr. Julio Cesar Falabella.
- He married Maria Luisa B de Falabella and after the death of Julio she continued.

- Some Falabella mini horses were stolen and hidden from the authorities by late Julio Falabella family members.
- Mini horses Falabella are exclusively those horses which descend from the mini horses bred by Don Julio Falabella.
- Whether Mr Evaristo Falabella is actually the grandnephew of Late Julio Falabella as he claims is unknown to Soledad Gramajo.
- Even in the unlikely event he can prove any relation with Julio Falabella it doesn't matter.
- So Evaristo Falabella should prove the means by which he acquired such animals from Julio Falabella's family.
- TFS registered horses that are traced back to the ACCF via DNA parentage testing.
- The co-existence of EFS and the TFS would only help to create confusion among buyers and the public.

At the beginning of September, a hearing organised by the RVO took place, at which the parties concerned were heard. Several factors played a role in the RVO's decision to declare TFS' objection unfounded.

- 1 After thorough investigation, it appears that Evaristo Falabella is indeed a grandson of a brother of Julio Falabella. Evaristo's father, Emigdio Falabella, bought a number of Julio's mares and stallions in 1980, before Julio's death, and continued breeding them.
- 2 There was no DNA data from Argentina for any of the horses ever imported from Argentina. Er bestaat niet zoiets als een Falabella DNA test.
- 3 There is no such thing as a Falabella DNA test
- 4 The DNA pattern of Falabella's was only established once they were in Europe
- 5 ACCF is not registered on the third country list
- 6 The Ministry of Agriculture Argentina has not confirmed ACCF's claim
- 7 EFS has done thorough research in advance on the accuracy of the information regarding history and origin of horses and will continue to do so in the future.
- 8 TFS is not recognised in the European Union!
- 9 ACCF is not recognised in the European Union!
- 10 As far as we know, no horses have been exported by the Gramajo family for over 10 years.
- 11 According to various reports, it is unlikely that ACCF still actively breeds horses.

Verdict of the hearing of 15 October 2021 UNFOUNDED!

- 1 TFS and FSE followed the guidelines of the ACCF.
- 2 At the end of 2019 FSE has decided to stop and to transfer everything to TFS, as of 28 April 2020 the recognition of FSE has been withdrawn.
- 3 There was NO other studbook in the European Union for the Falabella breed when the EFS was established.
- 4 UK is no longer a member of the European Union due to Brexit!
- 5 15 April 2021 EFS is recognised by the RVO as a daughter studbook of the studbook Mini Falabella in Argentina.
- 6 Due to the Brexit, the recognition of British studbooks has lapsed for the European Union.
- 7 TFS is on the list of third country breeding organisations. This means that TFS is allowed to issue zootechnical certificates allowing breeders to bring Falabella horses into the European Union as purebreds.
- 8 With such a zootechnical certificate, breeders are entitled to register their animals with a studbook for the same breed within the European Union.
- 9 TFS has an interest in ensuring that purebred Falabella horses or their offspring are entered in a herd book of the same breed in the European Union.
- 10 EFS is the only studbook for Falabella horses recognised within the European Union! And so that is the only option.

Objection TFS demands withdrawal of recognition!

- 1 TFS is the only one with the DNA database of the breed.
- 2 TFS is the only one recognised by the ACCF.
 - EFS has the right in principle to be recognised
 - That FSE claims that nobody wanted to take it over has no influence on that
 - The fact that ACCF only recognizes TFS has no influence on this because recognition of a subsidiary studbook in a member state of the European Union does not depend on the approval or authorisation by a studbook of origin or a third party
 - The studbook of origin for a breed is not maintained by a studbook association in a Member State of the EU or a breeding organisation in a third country for the Falabella breed
 - TFS is a subsidiary studbook and cannot claim the regulation.
- 3 Evaristo Falabella does not represent the studbook of origin!
 - The recognition of the EFS as a subsidiary studbook of the Evaristo Falabella studbook does not appear to damage or hinder the activities of TFS.
 - It is speculative that EFS would jeopardise the purity of the breed of Falabella horses through its recognition.
 - The EFS breeding programme does not differ substantially from the ACCF, TFS, FSE breeding programmes, i.e. the same rules/requirements regarding purity of breed are applied.

- TFS and EFS both perform the same parentage verification based on DNA analysis of the animal's parent pairs.
 - Given the DNA analyses carried out by TFS and EFS, it is not likely that the breed purity is at risk.
- 4 EFS and /or Evaristo Falabella issue certificates which should not be the case.
- No link has been explained between the issuing of certificates and the authorisation by the Argentine authorities of Evaristo Falabella
 - TFS has not been able to provide evidence of their claim.
- 5 TFS argues that SENASA requires that horses exported from Argentina as purebreds are approved by ACCF.
- Is not relevant because neither ACCF nor MiniFalabella are registered and therefore recognised by SENASA.
 - As such the requirements to import horses from ACCF or MiniFalabella are the same.
 - EFS and TFS can decide for themselves on what grounds they accept a horse, as long as it is in accordance with the rules in the breeding program.

Summary

- 1 EFS is rightly recognised and the only one for the European Union
- 2 ACCF and Mini Falabella are both equal according to the legislation
- 3 There is no evidence provided by TFS that proved to be correct regarding the rules and legislation
- 4 No DNA test is done to see if a horse is a Falabella, but only to check for parentage
- 5 EFS has equated ACCF and MiniFalabella
- 6 EFS has seen no basis in its investigation for the ACCF to still be recognised
- 7 In principle, the same requirements as in the regulation have to be met
- 8 ACCF does not meet the requirement of having enough breeding animals!
- 9 EFS has acted correctly and openly towards the RVO and EFS members.
- 10 The objection of TFS is unfounded